

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES 1st FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY HALL BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL SEPTEMBER 8, 2014 4:00 P.M.

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall Building, September 8, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez Commissioner Beatriz Lucero Commissioner Randy Brock Commissioner Cesar Gomez Commissioner John Moses

The following commissioners were not present:

Commissioner William Helm II Commissioner Ricardo Fernandez

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic Development Ms. Kristen Hamilton, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:11 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC - PUBLIC COMMENT

None.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. PHAP14-00022: Being 100 Government Hill 9 & E 35 ft. of 10, City of El Paso, El

Paso County, Texas

Location: 18 Cumberland Circle

Historic District: Austin Terrace

Property Owner: Emilia Ramos Pineda Representative: Monica Samano

Representative District: 2

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1930

Historic Status: Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a

pergola/porte cochere at the side of the house

Application Filed: 8/18/14 45 Day Expiration: 10/2/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a pergola/porte cochere at the side of the house. There is an existing pergola, at the rear of the property, that connects to the garage; however, the property owner would like to construct a covering (pergola/porte cochere) on the side of the home, in the driveway, as a means to shade her vehicle(s) and or additional space to entertain guests. The property owner would like to construct the same type pergola as the adjoining property owner (pergola was grandfathered). Ms. Velázquez read the following staff recommendations into the record:

The Historic Preservation Office recommends *APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Site features that may exist on a property are swimming pools, pergolas, terraces and gardens and every effort should be made to retain those features that remain.
- Place non-traditional site features such as swimming pools, playground equipment, concrete pads and basketball goals, tree houses, dumpsters, and trash receptacles only in areas such as rear yards, where they are not visible from the street.
- Design new garages and outbuildings to be compatible with the main structure on the lot in material and design, using existing historic outbuildings in the districts as an example.
- Limit the size and scale of garages and accessory structures so that the integrity of the original structure, or the size of the existing lot, is not compromised or significantly diminished.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- New work should be compatible with the character of the setting in terms of size, scale design, material, color, and texture.

*THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:

- 1. THAT THE STRUCTURE BE SET BACK AT LEAST TWO FEET BEHIND THE MAIN FAÇADE; AND
- 2. THAT IT NOT BE ATTACHED TO THE MAIN STRUCTURE

Chairman Berchelmann, Vice-Chairman Lopez, Commissioner Moses and Gomez commented.

Ms. Monica Samano, representative, explained the proposed pergola would match the design as the existing pergola in the rear of the home to include the same color stain for the columns and same color for the pergola. Additionally, the proposed pergola would not be built as an attachment to the main structure. Ms. Samano explained she will be planting ivy/vines that will eventually grow along the sides and top of the pergola to provide shade and noted no lighting would be added/included in the pergola.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH THE PERGOLA ON THE SIDE, WITH THE MODIFICATION THAT STRUCTURE BE SET BACK AT LEAST TWO FEET BEHIND THE MAIN STRUCTURE.

2. PHAP14-00023: Being 5 Mills 20 ft. on Mills X 80 ft. Beg. 95 ft. W. of NEC (1600 sq.

ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 114-A Mills Avenue

Historic District: Downtown

Property Owner: Martin Building LLC Representative: Martin Building LLC

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: C-5/H (Commercial/Historic)

Year Built: 1948 Historic Status: Landmark

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of the property

including a new storefront, signage, lighting, railings, and

modification of a window into a door.

Application Filed: 8/18/14 45 Day Expiration: 10/2/14

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of the property including a new storefront, signage, lighting, railings, and modification of a window into a door. Ms. Velázquez explained the Roberts Banner Building, a landmark built in 1912 with the added annex in 1948.

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

FAÇADE

The façade has been altered; however, the transom windows are original. There is a tri-partite configuration, each configuration differs in size; however, they share very similar characteristics with one rectangular window and one center awning window.

STOREFRONT PHOTOS

Various photos of the storefront were presented:

- 1. as it exists today bright aluminum
- 2. from the 1970's; and (the annex was seen next to the McDonald's)
- 3. circa 1920 (annex had not been constructed)

SPECIAL NOTE

Ms. Velázquez commented on the very typical corner storefront with the bulkhead or kneewall, very large storefront window, the divider between the transom and storefront window, and then the transom glass.

PURPOSED CHANGES

The purposed changes include:

- 1. Signage, reverse channel letters with lighting, to be mounted on the awning
- 2. Possibly new prism glass in the transom;
- 3. New garage door storefront, made of Corten steel and glass;
- 4. Entrance door with sidelight; and
- 5. Existing green tile to be replaced with white tile (sample of which were shown to commissioners).

EGRESS CODE

In order to meet egress code, and provide a safe exit, contractors must convert a second floor back window into a door.

To conclude, the property owner is introducing new material and new configuration while trying to bring life into the area.



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez The Historic Preservation Office recommends *APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Downtown Historic Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- Determine if the existing storefront is the original or a later alteration. Preserve original materials or details and the shape of original openings (otherwise the proportions of the façade will be lost). Replace missing original elements such as transom windows.
- Storefronts should be fabricated from wood, but metal storefronts will be acceptable provided that the design complements the architectural style of the façade and the surrounding area and entry doors complement the structure's architectural style.
- *Metal, vinyl, and synthetic materials may be used when:*
 - a) Proposed materials match existing material;
 - b) Original detailing is not altered;
 - c) Window and door trim is properly detailed; and
 - d) Unique finished are not covered or damaged
- New construction should be compatible with existing historic materials and construction details.
- San Jacinto Plaza Zone: It is recommended that storefronts be similar to that of the Cortez. The storefront has a relatively small wainscot with large display windows and the large double entry doors are topped with a transom.
- The original size, division and shape of display windows should be retained. Glass should be transparent for pedestrian viewing.
- Transom windows should be preserved and/or restored where possible. Transom windows may still be found underneath dropped ceilings and exterior cover-ups.
- Signs should not hide or cover any significant detailing and/or architectural detailing and/or architectural features of the building.
- On-premise signage should not cover windows, doors, or air vents.
- On-premise signs should be located in close proximity to the activity it is identifying. In most cases, the best location is usually above, on, and/or near the front door.
- Signs should not exceed thirty square feet in all commercial and manufacturing districts, and should not exceed six feet in height.
- Signs constructed for landmark buildings or sites must be made of materials attributed to the year in which the buildings or site was constructed.
- *Plastics are not permitted.*
- Designs should be innovate and compatible with the building and/or the surrounding area.
- Original metal material should be maintained where possible. If metal must be replaced, new metal should match the design, shape and color (if possible) of the original.



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

• New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

*THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:

- 1. THAT THE NEW STOREFRONT BE MADE OF A METAL OTHER THAN CORTEN STEEL;
- 2. THAT THE EXISTING GLASS IN THE TRANSOM WINDOWS BE RESTORED RATHER THAN REPLACED; AND
- 3. THAT THE ENTRY DOOR AND ROLL-DOWN GARAGE DOOR BE CONFIGURED TO LOOK LIKE A HISTORIC STOREFRONT.

Chairman Berchelmann, Vice-Chairman Lopez, Commissioner Moses and Gomez commented on using material other than Corten steel,

Ms. Velázquez explained Corten steel is a very new material, used for decorative monuments, and does not require a lot of maintenance.

Rather than Corten steel for the storefront, Vice-Chairman Lopez suggested contractors install painted steel, in keeping with the historic district.

Mr. Alejandro Borunda and Mr. Jaime Vasquez, representing Martin Building LLC, explained the following:

- 1. Framing for the garage door will be steel (red in color to coordinate with existing);
- 2. Railing on the bottom will be removable tube to allow patrons to sit outside;
- 3. Railing to be installed on the parapet;
- 4. Glass block windows on the top will be renovated to look as original as possible, similar to the Anson Mills and Cortez Buildings;
- 5. Damaged window, left hand side (*due to installation of A/C unit*) to be restored to its original state, as much as possible;
- 6. Proposed rollup garage door will provide outdoor ambience for patrons;
- 7. Existing storefront extremely altered from its original state;
 - a. Annex separate from Banner Building;
 - b. Façade and storefronts, with the awning on top, to resemble the Banner Building
- 8. Cortez Building photo:
 - a. Stucco;
 - b. No tile above;
 - c. Existing green tile to be replaced with white tile;
 - d. Grey, dark tile replaced with translucent type (with lighting from behind); not demolition necessary
 - e. Subway tile will have a brick type pattern;

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez Vice-Chairman Lopez asked the representatives if they were agreeable to the commissioner's requests/suggestions:

- 1. Brick pattern for the tile rather than a stacked tile pattern;
- 2. Painted steel (to match existing colors) rather than Corten steel for the garage door and entire storefront;
- 3. Entire canopy to be painted (two storefronts);
- 4. New sidewalks, with same pavers, will be installed; and
- 5. Basement to be used as office space.

FINAL COMMENTS

Messrs. Borunda and Vasquez were agreeable to requests/suggestions from commissioners; however, Mr. Vasquez was unclear as to the color commissioners wanted them to paint the storefront.

Vice-Chairman Lopez replied, black, to replicate the era.

Chairman Berchelmann reiterated Ms. Velázquez would be available to answer any questions Messrs. Borunda and Vasquez might have.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Ms. Velázquez to ensure the lighting design in the new piers on the outermost edges of the storefront would not compromise the structural integrity of the building. He made comments regarding the look of the garage door.

During the plan check process, Ms. Velázquez explained Building & Development Permitting staff would verify/ensure the structural integrity would not be destroyed. She confirmed the storefront configuration would be the same; however, the metal will not be Corten steel but painted steel.

Messrs. Borunda and Vasquez added comments concerning the purposed functionality of the garage door.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH THE FOLLOWING CHANGES:

- 1. STOREFRONT TO BE PAINTED STEEL NOT CORTEN, COLOR (DARK) TO BE APPROVED BY HPO;
- 2. SUBWAY TILE IN THE FRONT MUST BE INSTALLED IN A BRICK PATTERN; AND
- 3. TO RESTORE, AND REPLACE IF NECESSARY, EXISTING PRISM WINDOWS.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez **3.** PHAP14-00023: Being 9 Sunset Heights N 131.34 ft. of 1 To 7, City of El Paso, El

Paso County, Texas

Location: 525 Corto Way (600 W. Yandell Drive)

Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: Douglas Yost
Representative: Douglas Yost

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1910 Historic Status: Landmark

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition

above the garage, installation of new paving, a new driveway, new

wall, a new curb cub and alterations to the existing garage.

Application Filed: 8/21/14 45 Day Expiration: 10/5/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition above the garage, installation of new paving, a new driveway, new wall, a new curb cub and alterations to the existing garage. Ms. Velázquez stated this is a *Henry C. Trost* designed house.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends *APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Design new garages and outbuildings to be compatible with the main structure on the lot in material and design, using existing historic outbuildings in the districts as an example.
- Limit the size and scale of garages and accessory structures so that the integrity of the original structure, or the size of the existing lot, is not compromised or significantly diminished.
- New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation.
- Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions, materials and details with the existing structure.
- Design new buildings and their features to be compatible in scale, materials, proportions and details with existing historic structures.
- Design an addition that is compatible with but, subtly different from existing historic homes in the district.
- Solid walls are appropriate for the side property lines while an open fencing material is more appropriate for the front portion of the property.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

- Introduce new fences and walls compatible in material, design, scale, location, and size with original fences and walls in the historic district.
- The height of the proposed fence should complement the structure and should not obstruct the public's view of the building. Any proposed fence higher than 32" solid or 48" open, measured from ground level, at front property line or a side yard property line on a corner lot, shall be reviewed by the HLC.
- Where additional parking is necessary it should be located to the rear of the property as well.
- Proposals for secondary driveways shall be reviewed and considered by the Historic Landmark Commission for approval.
- New and replacement portions of sidewalks and driveways shall be constructed in material, finish, color, scoring, grid pattern, and control joints to match existing or the surrounding original paving.
- Grass and sod may be removed from front yards, side yards on a corner provided not more than 50% of the area is covered with gravel or other masonry. The remaining 50% must be covered with trees and living plants that provide ground cover.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

• New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

*THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE ROOFLINE/PARAPET ON THE MAIN FAÇADE OF THE GARAGE ADDITION BE MODIFIED TO CONFORM MORE CLOSELY WITH THE ROOFLINE OF THE HOUSE.

Chairman Berchelmann, Vice-Chairman Lopez and Commissioners Gomez and Moses made comments.

Mr. Doug Yost, property owner, responded to comments and/or questions from commissioners and staff.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH THE MODIFICATION THAT THE TOWER ON THE EAST SIDE BE THE SAME AS THE TOWER ON THE SOUTH SIDE.

4. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. September 8, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the September 22, 2014 meeting. September 22, 2014 meeting.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

September 22nd meeting

Staff will update commissioners on property located at 1033 Upson Drive.

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

HLC Staff Report

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for staff.

Commissioner Moses commented on a request to remove and replace cardboard siding with cardboard siding and highlighted the number of cases (x3) relating to gas lines.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Other Business - Discussion and Action

6. Results of research on the City of San Antonio Historic Guidelines and codified violations specific to penalties and the enforcement thereof and the State of Texas' Texas Historical Commission regarding same.

Item was postponed to the September 22nd HLC meeting.

7. Chapter 20.20 review and proposed changes on September 22, 2014.

At the next HLC meeting, commissioners will analyze the existing code line by line. Ms. Velázquez requested commissioners bring their suggested amendments with them for consideration.

8. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for August 18, 2014.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections, and/or revisions for staff.

TOP of PAGE 12 of 13

Chairman Berchelmann requested staff revise the following sentence:

Chairman Berchelmann asked staff if it were possible to include language in the ordinance regarding treble/triple damages.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov
Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 18, 2014 MEETING MINUTES, AS REVISED.

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Lucero

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:20 P.M.